

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

US DOMINION, INC., DOMINION)	
VOTING SYSTEMS, INC., and DOMINION)	
VOTING SYSTEMS CORPORATION,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	
)	Case No. 1:21-cv-00040-CJN
v.)	
)	
SIDNEY POWELL, SIDNEY POWELL,)	
P.C., and DEFENDING THE REPUBLIC,)	
INC.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	
)	

**DOMINION’S OPPOSITION
TO DEFENDANTS’ MOTION TO DISMISS**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES..... ii

I. Powell’s defamatory falsehoods are actionable.2

A. Powell’s statements are actionable because they are susceptible of being proven true or false and are reasonably understood as assertions of fact.2

B. Even if Powell’s statements were “opinions,” they would be actionable as defamation because they reasonably imply false facts and because Powell’s disclosure of the facts was both incorrect and incomplete.5

C. Attorneys do not have a license to lie......10

II. Powell made her false claims with actual malice......12

A. Powell intentionally lied and manufactured fake evidence.12

B. The Complaint also pleads circumstantial evidence of actual malice......17

III. Defendants are subject to personal jurisdiction in the District of Columbia......25

A. D.C.’s Long-Arm Statute confers jurisdiction over the Defendants......26

 1. This Court has jurisdiction under D.C. Code § 13-423 (a)(1) because the Defendants transacted business in Washington, D.C.26

 2. This Court also has jurisdiction under D.C. Code § 13-423 (a)(3) because the Defendants caused tortious injury in Washington, D.C. by acts within the District.29

 3. This Court has jurisdiction under D.C. Code § 13-423 (a)(4) because Defendants caused tortious injury in Washington, D.C. by additional acts outside the District, while engaging in a persistent course of conduct in D.C.31

B. Jurisdiction is proper under the Due Process Clause.33

C. This Court also has jurisdiction over Powell’s law firm and fundraising website because they are Powell’s alter egos.34

IV. Venue is proper in this District, and the case should not be transferred.37

V. The Complaint states a claim for defamation against Defending the Republic, Inc.39

VI. The Complaint states a claim for deceptive trade practices......41

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE45

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases	Page(s)
<i>3P-733, LLC v. Davis</i> , 187 A.D.3d 626 (N.Y. App. Div. 2020).....	10
<i>Action Repair, Inc. v. Am. Broad. Cos., Inc.</i> , 776 F.2d 143 (7th Cir. 1985).....	8
<i>Allen v. Nelnet, Inc.</i> , No. 06-cv-00586, 2007 WL 2786432 (D. Colo. Sept. 24, 2007).....	15
<i>Ashhab-Jones v. Cherokee Nat’l Strategic Programs, LLC</i> , No. 19-00089, 2020 WL 6262090 (D.D.C. Oct. 23, 2020).....	29
<i>Blumenthal v. Drudge</i> , 992 F. Supp. 44 (D.D.C. 1998).....	30
<i>Bolinger v. First Multiple Listing Serv., Inc.</i> , 838 F. Supp. 2d 1340 (N.D. Ga. 2012).....	41
<i>Burman v. Phoenix Worldwide Indus., Inc.</i> , 437 F. Supp. 2d 142 (D.D.C. 2006).....	30
<i>Cal. Motor Transp. Co. v. Trucking Unlimited</i> , 404 U.S. 508 (1972).....	12
<i>Celle v. Filipino Reporter Enters. Inc.</i> , 209 F.3d 163 (2d Cir. 2000).....	17
<i>Cohane v. Arpeja-California, Inc.</i> , 385 A.2d 153 (D.C.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 439 U.S. 980 (1978).....	33
<i>Como v. Riley</i> , 287 A.D.2d 416 (N.Y. App. Div. 2001).....	6
<i>Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Mann</i> , 150 A.3d 1213 (D.C. 2016).....	16, 17, 24
<i>Corsi v. Caputo</i> , No. 19-cv-1573, 2020 WL 1703934 (D.D.C. Apr. 7, 2020).....	29
<i>Corsi v. Info Wars, LLC</i> , No. 19-cv-656, 2020 WL 1156864 (D.D.C. Mar. 10, 2020).....	37

Crane v. N.Y. Zoological Soc’y,
894 F.2d 454 (D.C. Cir. 1990).....31

Dalbec v. Gentleman’s Companion, Inc.,
828 F.2d 921 (2d Cir. 1987)17

Daley v. Alpha Kappa Alpha Sorority, Inc.,
26 A.3d 723 (D.C. 2011)33

Davis v. Boeheim,
24 N.Y.3d 262 (2014).....7

Davita, Inc. v. Nephrology Assocs., P.C.,
253 F. Supp. 2d 1370 (S.D. Ga. 2003)41

Di Bernardo v. Tonawanda Publ’g Corp.,
499 N.Y.S.2d 553 (1986)4

Egiazaryan v. Zalmayev,
880 F. Supp. 2d 494 (S.D.N.Y. 2012)6

Enigma Software Grp. USA, LLC v. Bleeping Computer LLC,
194 F. Supp. 3d 263 (S.D.N.Y. 2016)4, 7

Eramo v. Rolling Stone, LLC,
209 F. Supp. 3d 862 (W.D. Va. 2016).....17

Exelon Generation Co. v. Grumbles,
380 F. Supp. 3d 1 (D.D.C. 2019).....37

Fisher v. Bander,
519 A.2d 162 (D.C. 1986)26

Flowers v. Carville,
310 F.3d 1118 (9th Cir. 2002)14

Garrison v. Louisiana,
379 U.S. 64 (1964)11, 13

Germain v. M&T Bank Corp.,
111 F. Supp. 3d 506, 536 (S.D.N.Y. 2015)4

Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc.,
418 U.S. 323 (1974)12, 18

Good Gov’t Grp. of Seal Beach v. Super. Ct. of L.A. Cty.,
22 Cal. 3d 672 (1978)12

Gordon v. Boyles,
99 P.3d 75 (Colo. App. 2004).....8

Grayson v. Ressler & Ressler,
271 F. Supp. 3d 501 (S.D.N.Y. 2017)6

Greenberg v. Spitzer,
62 N.Y.S.3d 372 (2017)4

Gross v. N.Y. Times Co.,
82 N.Y.2d 146 (1993).....4, 5, 7

GTE New Media v. BellSouth Corp.,
199 F.3d 1343 (D.C. Cir. 2000).....33

H & R Indus., Inc. v. Kirshner,
899 F. Supp. 995 (E.D.N.Y. 1995).....6

Harris v. City of Seattle,
152 F. App'x 565 (9th Cir. 2005).....17, 18

Harte-Hanks Commc'ns, Inc. v. Connaughton,
491 U.S. 657 (1989)17, 19, 22

Hartigan v. Maclean Hunter Publ'g Corp.,
457 N.E.2d 480 (Ill. App. 1983).....42

Helmer v. Doletskaya,
393 F.3d 201 (D.D.C. 2004).....29

Herbert v. Lando,
441 U.S. 153 (1979)21

Holder v. Haarman & Reimer Corp.,
779 A.2d 264 (D.C. 2001)28

Houlahan v. Freeman Wall Aiello,
15 F. Supp. 3d 77 (D.D.C. 2014).....19

Hourani v. Psybersolutions, LLC,
164 F. Supp. 3d 128 (D.D.C. 2016).....29

Howser v. Pearson,
95 F. Supp. 936 (D.D.C. 1951).....30

Hutchinson v. Proxmire,
443 U.S. 111 (1979)16

IMAPizza, LLC v. At Pizza Ltd.,
334 F. Supp. 3d 95 (D.D.C. 2018).....27, 28

IMark Mktg. Servs., LLC v. Geoplast S.p.A.,
753 F. Supp. 2d 141 (D.D.C. 2010).....35

Int’l Brominated Solvents Ass’n v. Am. Conf. of Governmental Indus. Hygienists,
625 F. Supp. 2d 1310 (M.D. Ga. 2008).....42

Int’l Shoe Co. v. Washington,
326 U.S. 310 (1945)33

Johns v. Newsmax Media, Inc.,
887 F. Supp. 2d 90 (D.D.C. 2012).....37

Kaelin v. Global Commc’ns Corp.,
162 F.3d 1036 (9th Cir. 1998).....17, 22

Keeton v. Hustler,
465 U.S. 770 (1984)30

Kelleher v. Dream Catcher, L.L.C.,
263 F. Supp. 3d 322 (D.D.C. 2017).....36

Keohane v. Stewart,
882 P.2d 1293 (Colo. 1994)4, 8, 12

Kuhn v. Trib.-Republican Publ’g Co.,
637 P.2d 315 (Colo. 1981)8, 22

Lapointe v. Van Note,
No. 03-cv-2128, 2004 WL 3609346 (D.D.C. Nov. 9, 2004).....30

Lawrence v. Bauer Publ’g & Printing Ltd.,
459 U.S. 999 (1982)16, 45

Lewy v. S. Poverty L. Ctr., Inc.,
723 F. Supp. 2d 116 (D.D.C. 2010).....31, 32

Lieberman v. Gelstein,
605 N.E.2d 344 (N.Y. 1992)21

Lopes v. JetsetDC, LLC,
994 F. Supp. 2d 135 (D.D.C. 2014).....36

Macaluso v. Jenkins,
95 Ill. App. 3d 461 (1981).....35

Mangan v. Corp. Synergies Grp., Inc.,
834 F. Supp. 2d 199 (D.N.J. 2011).....39, 40

Masson v. New Yorker Mag., Inc.,
960 F.2d 896 (9th Cir. 1992).....22

McWilliams Ballard, Inc. v. Broadway Mgmt. Co., Inc.,
636 F. Supp. 2d 1 (D.D.C. 2009).....35

Members of City Council of L.A. v. Taxpayers for Vincent,
466 U.S. 789 (1984)12

Metabolife Int’l, Inc. v. Wornick,
264 F.3d 832 (9th Cir. 2001).....20

Milkovich v. Lorain J. Co.,
497 U.S. 1 (1990)4, 5, 6, 7

N.Y. Times Co. v. Sullivan,
376 U.S. 254 (1964)13

NAACP v. Button,
371 U.S. 415 (1963)12

Nader v. Toledano,
408 A.2d 31 (D.C. 1979).....16

Navab-Safavi v. Broad. Bd. of Governors,
650 F. Supp. 2d 40 (D.D.C. 2009).....29

NBC Subsidiary (KCNC-TV), Inc. v. Living Will Ctr.,
879 P.2d 6 (Colo. 1994)8

Oetiker v. Jurid Werke, G.m.b.H.,
556 F.2d 1 (D.C. Cir. 1977).....33

Overstock.com, Inc. v. Gradient Analytics, Inc.,
151 Cal. App. 4th 688 (2007).....22

Palin v. N.Y. Times Co.,
264 F. Supp. 3d 527 (S.D.N.Y. 2017)11

Palin v. N.Y. Times Co.,
940 F.3d 804 (2d Cir. 2019).....11, 13, 17, 24, 39, 40

Parsi v. Daiouleslam,
595 F. Supp. 2d 99 (D.D.C. 2009).....23

Planned Parenthood of Columbia/Willamette, Inc. v. Am. Coal. Of Life Activists,
244 F.3d 1007 (9th Cir. 2001).....12

Plesha v. Ferguson,
760 F. Supp. 2d 90 (D.D.C. 2011).....26

Poling v. Farrah,
131 F. Supp. 2d 191 (D.D.C. 2001).....33

Quality Air Servs., L.L.C. v. Milwaukee Valve Co.,
567 F. Supp. 2d 96 (D.D.C. 2008).....27

Restis v. Am. Coal. Against Nuclear Iran, Inc.,
53 F. Supp. 3d 705 (S.D.N.Y. 2014)4, 12, 40

Reuber v. United States,
750 F.2d 1039 (D.C. Cir. 1984).....30

Sang v. Hai,
951 F. Supp. 2d 504 (S.D.N.Y. 2013)10

Schiavone Constr. Co. v. Time, Inc.,
847 F.2d 1069 (3d Cir. 1988)15, 17

Seidl v. Greentree Mortg. Co.,
30 F. Supp. 2d 1292 (D. Colo. 1998)11

Shapiro, Lifschitz, & Schram, P.C. v. Hazard,
24 F. Supp. 2d 66 (D.D.C. 1998).....38

Shapiro, Lifschitz, & Schram, P.C. v. Hazard,
90 F. Supp. 2d 15 (D.D.C. 2000).....34

Sharon v. Time, Inc.,
599 F. Supp. 538 (S.D.N.Y. 1984)18, 20

Sheraton Operating Corp. v. Just Corp. Travel,
984 F. Supp. 22 (D.D.C. 1997).....39

Shoppers Food Warehouse v. Moreno,
746 A.2d 320 (D.C. 2000).....27, 33, 34

Silsdorf v. Levine,
449 N.E.2d 716 (N.Y 1983)6, 12

Slaughter v. Friedman,
32 Cal. 3d 149 (1982).....7

<i>Solano v. Playgirl, Inc.</i> , 292 F.3d 1078 (9th Cir. 2002).....	17, 22
<i>Solstein v. Mirra</i> , 488 F. Supp. 3d 86 (S.D.N.Y. 2020).....	4
<i>St. Amant v. Thompson</i> , 390 U.S. 727 (1968).....	16, 17, 18, 20
<i>Steinberg v. Int’l Crim. Police Org.</i> , 672 F.2d 927 (D.C. Cir. 1981).....	32, 33
<i>Steinhilber v. Alphonse</i> , 68 N.Y.2d 283 (1986).....	6
<i>Stewart v. Azar</i> , 308 F. Supp. 3d 239 (D.D.C. 2018).....	38
<i>StopLoss Specialists, LLC v. VeriClaim, Inc.</i> , 340 F. Supp. 3d 1334 (N.D. Ga. 2018).....	39, 40
<i>Suzuki Motor Corp. v. Consumers Union of U.S., Inc.</i> , 330 F.3d 1110 (9th Cir. 2003).....	14, 22
<i>Tah v. Glob. Witness Publ’g, Inc.</i> , No. 19-7132, 2021 WL 1045205 (D.C. Cir. Mar. 19, 2021).....	17, 18
<i>Teilhaver Mfg. Co. v. Unarco Materials Storage, a Div. of Unarco Indus., Inc.</i> , 791 P.2d 1164 (Colo. App. 1989).....	8
<i>Thayer/Patricof Educ. Funding v. Pryor Res.</i> , 196 F. Supp. 2d 21 (D.D.C. 2002).....	39
<i>Thompson v. Bosswick</i> , 855 F. Supp. 2d 67 (S.D.N.Y. 2012).....	4
<i>Tomblin v. WCHS-TV8</i> , 434 F. App’x 205 (4th Cir. 2011).....	15
<i>Trump v. Comm. on Ways and Means</i> , 415 F. Supp. 3d 98 (D.D.C. 2019).....	28
<i>United States v. TDC Mgmt. Corp.</i> , 263 F. Supp. 3d 257 (D.D.C. 2017).....	34
<i>Unker v. Joseph Markovits, Inc.</i> , 643 F. Supp. 1043 (S.D.N.Y. 1986).....	39, 40

VECC, Inc. v. Bank of Nova Scotia,
296 F. Supp. 2d 617 (D.V.I. 2003).....39, 40

Ventura v. Kyle,
63 F. Supp. 3d 1001 (D. Minn. 2014),
rev'd on other grounds, 825 F. 3d 876 (8th Cir. 2016).....24

Walden v. Fiore,
571 U.S. 277 (2014)33

Watts v. United States,
394 U.S. 705 (1969)12

White v. Fraternal Ord. of Police,
909 F.2d 512 (D.C. Cir. 1990).....5

Wilbanks v. Wolk,
121 Cal. App. 4th 883 (2004).....7

Wilderness Soc’y v. Babbitt,
104 F. Supp. 2d 10 (D.D.C. 2000).....38

Williams v. Burns,
540 F. Supp. 1243 (D. Col. 1982)11

World-Wide Volkswagen v. Woodson,
444 U.S. 286 (1980)34

Wormley v. United States,
601 F. Supp. 2d 27 (D.D.C. 2009).....29

Zerangue v. TSP Newspapers, Inc.,
814 F.2d 1066 (5th Cir. 1987)24

Zimmerman v. Al Jazeera Am., LLC,
246 F. Supp. 3d 257 (D.D.C. 2017).....18

Statutes

28 U.S.C. § 139137

D.C. Code § 13-423.....26, 29, 31, 34

Ga. Code 10-1-37241

Rules

Fed. R. Civ. P. 11.....24

Other Authorities

1 Rodney Smolla, Law of Defamation § 3:71 (2d ed.)..... 18

Restatement (Second) of Torts § 58024